



## METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

January 31, 2020

Jonathon Holmes  
Messer Construction Co.  
230 Great Circle Road, Suite 218  
Nashville, TN 37228

Re: **RFQ # 14013, New Donelson Library (Design Build)**

Dear Mr. Holmes,

The Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County (Metro) has completed the evaluation of submitted solicitation offer(s) to the above RFQ # 14013, New Donelson Library (Design Build). This letter hereby notifies you of Metro's intent to award to **Messer Construction Co.**, contingent upon successful contract negotiations. Please provide a certificate of Insurance indicating all applicable coverages within 15 business days of the receipt of this letter.

If the Equal Business Opportunity (EBO) Program requirements were a part of this solicitation, the awardee must forward a signed copy of the "Letter of Intent to Perform as Subcontractor/Subconsultant/Supplier/Joint Venture" for any minority/women-owned business enterprises included in the response to the Business Assistance Office within two business days from this notification.

Additionally, the awardee will be required to submit evidence of participation of and contractor's payment to all Small, Minority, and Women Owned Businesses participation in any resultant contract. This evidence shall be submitted monthly and include copies of subcontracts or purchase orders, the Prime Contractor's Application for Payment, or invoices, and cancelled checks or other supporting payment documents. Should you have any questions concerning this requirement, please contact **Joe Ann Carr**, BAO Representative, at **(615) 880-2338** or at [joeann.carr@nashville.gov](mailto:joeann.carr@nashville.gov).

Depending on the file sizes, the responses to the procurement solicitation and supporting award documentation can be made available either by email, CD for pickup, or in person for inspection. If you desire to receive or review the documentation or have any questions, please contact Buyer **Brad Wall** by email at [brad.wall@nashville.gov](mailto:brad.wall@nashville.gov) Monday through Friday between 8:30am and 3:30pm.

Thank you for participating in Metro's competitive procurement process.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Michelle A. Hernandez Lane".

Michelle A. Hernandez Lane  
Purchasing Agent

Cc: Solicitation File, Other Offerors

**Pursuant to M.C.L. 4.36.010 Authority to resolve protested solicitations and awards.**

**A. Right to Protest.** Any actual or prospective bidder, offeror or contractor who is aggrieved in connection with the solicitation or award of a contract may protest to the Purchasing Agent. The protest shall be submitted in writing within ten (10) days after such aggrieved person knows or should have known of the facts giving rise thereto.

Procurement Division

730 Second Avenue South, Suite 112  
P.O. Box 196300  
Nashville, Tennessee 37219-6300

[www.Nashville.gov](http://www.Nashville.gov)  
Phone: 615-862-6180  
Fax: 615-862-6179

**RFQ # 14013 - New Donelson Library (Design Build)**

	<b>American Constructors, Inc.</b>	<b>Baron Construction, LLC</b>	<b>Barton Malow Company</b>	<b>Dowdle Construction Group, LLC.</b>	<b>Hardaway Construction Corp.</b>	<b>Messer Construction Co.</b>
Contract Acceptance	Accepted with no exceptions	Accepted with no exceptions	Accepted with no exceptions	Accepted with no exceptions	Accepted with no exceptions	Contract exceptions
Cost (35 points)	29.71	35.00	28.89	33.30	32.02	29.83
Experience and Qualifications (35 Points)	20.00	18.00	32.00	23.00	23.00	31.00
General Management Plan, Approach, and Capacity (30 Points)	20.00	16.00	29.00	23.00	23.00	30.00
<b>Total (100 Points)</b>	<b>69.71</b>	<b>69.00</b>	<b>89.89</b>	<b>79.30</b>	<b>78.02</b>	<b>90.83</b>

**American Constructors, Inc.**

**Strengths** - The offeror provided a detailed project organization chart. The offeror provided detailed resumes. The offeror provided detailed information about their background, experience, and qualifications necessary to accomplish the services being requested in this solicitation. The offeror stated that they have no current or pending litigations. Some of the listed reference projects were of similar scope as to what Metro is seeking to procure. The offeror provided a detailed project management plan. The offeror identified anticipated risk associated with the project and countermeasures that would be employed to minimize those risks. The offeror provided a detailed list of the major construction and/or design projects that their team currently has in progress. The offeror provided a detailed summary of their approach to maintaining a safe work environment and provided detailed information about their Experience Modification Rating (EMR). The offeror provided detailed information on their approach to workforce engagement to support Metro's commitment to the creation of jobs.

**Weaknesses** - The identification of at least one (1) key personnel of the team that has experience in designing and constructing LEED certified buildings was unclear. The identification of at least one (1) key personnel of the team that has experience in designing and constructing low EUI facilities and/or Net Zero Energy facilities was unclear. Some of the listed reference projects were not of similar scope as to what Metro is seeking to procure. The offeror's description of their process to achieve the energy performance requirements lacked specific detail. Offeror failed to describe how work for Metro would be prioritized given their current projects and obligations. The offeror's responses to the evaluation criteria were difficult to locate throughout the proposal.

**Baron Construction, LLC**

**Strengths** - The offeror provided detailed resumes. The offeror identified at least one (1) key member of the team as the LEED Accredited Professional (LEED AP) and provided information about a LEED certified project they completed. The offeror identified several key members of the team that have experience in designing and constructing LEED certified buildings. The offeror identified several key members of the team that has experience in designing and constructing low EUI facilities and/or Net Zero Energy facilities. The offeror provided a detailed description of their plan and process to achieve the energy performance requirements. The offeror stated that they have no current or pending litigations.

**Weaknesses** - The offeror failed to provide a project organization chart. The offeror's description of their one (1) completed project within the last ten (10) years that achieved Net Zero Energy and/or a low energy performing facility with an EUI of 40 or below lacked specific detail. The offeror lacked specific detail regarding their experience and qualifications in a leadership role on a design build project. The offeror's reference projects were not of similar scope and complexity. Several of the reference projects submitted lacked specific detail such as the schedule duration and the budget for the project. The offeror's description of their project management plan lacked specific detail. The offeror's risk associated with the project and countermeasures that would be employed to minimize those risks was generic; specifically, they didn't address how they will mitigate risk. The offeror's internal collaboration plans lacked specific detail to implement design build strategies necessary to meet LEED certification. The offeror failed to list the percentage complete for each major construction and/or design projects currently in progress. The offeror lacked specific detail on their approach to workforce engagement to support Metro's commitment to the creation of jobs.

**Barton Malow Company**

**Strengths** - The offeror provided a detailed project organization chart. The offeror provided detailed resumes. The offeror identified at least one (1) key member of the team as the LEED Accredited Professional (LEED AP) and provided information about a LEED certified project they completed. The offeror identified several key members of the team that have experience in designing and constructing LEED certified buildings. The offeror identified at least one (1) key member of the team that has experience in designing and constructing low EUI facilities and/or Net Zero Energy facilities. The offeror provided at least one (1) completed project within the last ten (10) years that achieved Net Zero Energy and/or a low energy performing facility with an EUI of 40 or below. The offeror provided detailed information about their background, experience, and qualifications necessary to accomplish the services being requested in this solicitation. Some of the listed reference projects were of similar scope as to what Metro is seeking to procure. The offeror provided detailed information about any claims and the status of any currently pending mediation, arbitration or litigation proceedings. The offeror provided a detailed project management plan. The offeror identified anticipated risk associated with the project and countermeasures that would be employed to minimize those risks. The offeror identified key activities and/or challenges directly related to this type of project. The offeror provided a detailed plan that would be used to ensure that this facility meets at a minimum a LEED Silver certification and meets the energy performance requirements. The offeror provided a detailed description of how work for Metro would be prioritized given their current project and obligations. The offeror provided a detailed description of their record keeping, reporting, monitoring, and other information systems that would be employed during both preconstruction and construction to provide updates on the project. The offeror provided detailed information on their ability to use Building Information Modeling (BIM) and other preconstruction and construction service technologies. The offeror provided a detailed summary of their approach to maintaining a safe work environment and provided detailed information about their Experience Modification Rating (EMR). The offeror provided detailed information on their approach to workforce engagement to support Metro's commitment to the creation of jobs.

**Weaknesses** - Some of the listed reference projects were not of similar scope as to what Metro is seeking to procure. The offer didn't provide complete date details for their team's major construction and/or design projects in progress.

**Dowdle Construction Group, LLC**

**Strengths** - The offeror provided a detailed project organization chart. The offeror provided detailed resumes. The offeror identified at least one (1) key member of the team as the LEED Accredited Professional (LEED AP) and provided information about a LEED certified project they completed. The offeror identified several key members of the team that have experience in designing and constructing LEED certified buildings. The offeror identified at least one (1) key member of the team that has experience in designing and constructing low EUI facilities and/or Net Zero Energy facilities. The offeror provided at least one (1) completed project within the last ten (10) years that achieved Net Zero Energy and/or a low energy performing facility with an EUI of 40 or below. Some of the listed reference projects were of similar scope as to what Metro is seeking to procure. The offeror provided a detailed project management plan. The offeror identified anticipated risk associated with the project and countermeasures that would be employed to minimize those risks. The offeror identified key activities and/or challenges directly related to this type of project. The offeror provided a detailed list of the major construction and/or design projects that their team currently has in progress. The offeror provided detailed information on their ability to use Building Information Modeling (BIM) and other preconstruction and construction service technologies.

**Weaknesses** - The offeror failed to provide detailed information about their background, experience, and qualifications necessary to accomplish the services being requested in this solicitation. Some of the listed reference projects were not of similar scope as to what Metro is seeking to procure. The offeror failed to provide information about any claims and the status of any currently pending mediation, arbitration or litigation proceedings. The offeror lacked specific detail on their record keeping, reporting, monitoring, and other information systems that would be employed during both preconstruction and construction to provide updates on the project. The offeror's summary of their approach to maintaining a safe work environment lacked specific detail. The offeror lacked specific detail on their approach to workforce engagement to support Metro's commitment to the creation of jobs. The offeror's responses to the evaluation criteria were difficult to locate throughout the proposal.

#### **Hardaway Construction Corp.**

**Strengths** - The offeror provided a detailed project organization chart. The offeror provided detailed resumes. The offeror identified at least one (1) key member of the team as the LEED Accredited Professional (LEED AP) and provided information about a LEED certified project they completed. The offeror identified several key members of the team that have experience in designing and constructing LEED certified buildings. The offeror identified at least one (1) key member of the team that has experience in designing and constructing low EUI facilities and/or Net Zero Energy facilities. The offeror provided at least one (1) completed project within the last ten (10) years that achieved Net Zero Energy and/or a low energy performing facility with an EUI of 40 or below. Some of the listed reference projects were of similar scope as to what Metro is seeking to procure. The offeror provided a detailed project management plan. The offeror identified key activities and/or challenges directly related to this type of project. The offeror provided a detailed plan that would be used to ensure that this facility meets at a minimum a LEED Silver certification and meets the energy performance requirements. The offeror provided detailed information on their ability to use Building Information Modeling (BIM) and other preconstruction and construction service technologies. The offeror provided detailed information on their approach to workforce engagement to support Metro's commitment to the creation of jobs.

**Weaknesses** - The offeror failed to provide detailed information about their background, experience, and qualifications necessary to accomplish the services being requested in this solicitation. Some of the listed reference projects were not of similar scope as to what Metro is seeking to procure. The offeror failed to provide information about any claims and the status of any currently pending mediation, arbitration or litigation proceedings. The offeror's risk associated with the project and countermeasures that would be employed to minimize those risks lacked specific detail. The offeror lacked specific detail on their record keeping, reporting, monitoring, and other information systems that would be employed during both preconstruction and construction to provide updates on the project. The offeror failed to provide a summary of their approach to maintaining a safe work environment. The offeror's responses to the evaluation criteria were difficult to locate throughout the proposal.

#### **Messer Construction Co.**

**Strengths** - The offeror provided a detailed project organization chart. The offeror identified at least one (1) key member of the team as the LEED Accredited Professional (LEED AP) and provided information about a LEED certified project they completed. The offeror identified several key members of the team that have experience in designing and constructing LEED certified buildings. The offeror identified at least one (1) key member of the team that has experience in designing and constructing low EUI facilities and/or Net Zero Energy facilities. The offeror provided at least one (1) completed project within the last ten (10) years that achieved Net Zero Energy and/or a low energy performing facility with an EUI of 40 or below. The offeror provided detailed information about their background, experience, and qualifications necessary to accomplish the services being requested in this solicitation. Some of the listed reference projects were of similar scope as to what Metro is seeking to procure. The offeror provided a detailed project management plan. The offeror identified anticipated risk associated with the project and countermeasures that would be employed to minimize those risks. The offeror identified key activities and/or challenges directly related to this type of project. The offeror provided a detailed plan that would be used to ensure that this facility meets at a minimum a LEED Silver certification and meets the energy performance requirements. The offeror provided a detailed description of how work for Metro would be prioritized given their current project and obligations. The offeror provided a detailed list of the major construction and/or design projects that their team currently has in progress. The offeror provided a detailed description of their record keeping, reporting, monitoring, and other information systems that would be employed during both preconstruction and construction to provide updates on the project. The offeror provided detailed information on their ability to use Building Information Modeling (BIM) and other preconstruction and construction service technologies. The offeror provided a detailed summary of their approach to maintaining a safe work environment and provided detailed information about their Experience Modification Rating (EMR). The offeror provided detailed information on their approach to workforce engagement to support Metro's commitment to the creation of jobs.

**Weaknesses** - Some of the resumes submitted didn't include their years of experience (number of years) providing the required services; especially, for positions of critical performance. Some of the listed reference projects were not of similar scope as to what Metro is seeking to procure. The offeror failed to provide information about any claims and the status of any currently pending mediation, arbitration or litigation proceedings.

Solicitation Title & Number			RFP Cost Points	RFP SBE/SDV Points	Total Cost Points
New Donelson Library; RFQ # 14013			28	7	35
Offeror's Name	Total Bid Amount	SBE/SDV Participation Amount	RFP Cost Points	RFP SBE/SDV Points	Total Cost Points
American Constructors, Inc.	\$11,793,761.92	\$183,578.00	27.84	1.87	29.71
Baron Construction, LLC	\$11,725,125.93	\$687,581.00	28.00	7.00	35.00
Barton Malow Company	\$11,887,453.97	\$125,000.00	27.62	1.27	28.89
Dowdle Construction Group, LLC	\$11,883,958.57	\$557,523.00	27.63	5.68	33.30
Hardaway Construction Corp	\$12,581,249.21	\$582,340.00	26.09	5.93	32.02
Messer Construction Co	\$11,931,655.63	\$227,775.00	27.52	2.32	29.83



# Statement of M/WBE Utilization

Proposer's/Firm's Name:	Proposer's Phone #:
Solicitation Title:	Proposer's Email Address:
Solicitation #:	Amount Self-performed :
Proposer's/Firm's Ownership:	Total Bid Amount:
<b>Proposed EBO Goal (%):</b> _____ MBE% _____ WBE%	EBO Goal Met? (Y/N)

The following MWBE\* subcontractor(s)/supplier(s) will be utilized for the performance of this project:

	MBE/WBE Firm Name	MBE/WBE Firm Address	Phone/E-Mail	Certificate Type (MBE or WBE)	* MBE/WBE Group Type *	Code # UNSPS/NAICS	Description of Work	MBE/WBE Dollars (\$)	Percent of Total Contract
1									
2									
3									
4									
5									
6									
7									

I am the duly authorized representative and certify the facts and representations contained in this form and supporting documents are true and correct.

Authorized Representative (Printed Name/Title/Signature)	Date
--	------

\*Note: MWBE is defined as business enterprise maintaining a significant business presence in the Program Area & performing a commercial useful function that is owned by one or more of the following: (1) African Americans (2) Native Americans, (3) Hispanic Americans, (4) Asian Americans, and (5) Women.

### For Internal Office Use ONLY

Has Prime Complied with EBO Goal?

If No, Good Faith Efforts Met?

BAO Representative:

Date:

Total MBE Subcontracting	_____ %	\$ _____
Total WBE Subcontracting	_____ %	\$ _____
Total MBE/WBE Participation:	_____ %	\$ _____

## BAO SBE Assessment Sheet

**BAO Specialist:** JoeAnn Carr

**Contract Specialist:** Brad Wall

12/16/2019

**Department Name:** General Services

**RFP/ITB Number:** 14013

**Project Name:** New Donelson Library Design

Primary Contractor*	Prime Bid Amount	Total Proposed SBE (\$)	SBE Subs approved?	SBE (%)	Comments
American Constructors, Inc.	\$11,793,761.92	\$183,578.00	Y	1.56	Proposed the inclusion of Metro-approved SBEs; Centric Architecture, Hawkins Partners, Barge Cauthen & Associates, Inc, Wilmot Inc., and E-Solutions.
Baron Construction, LLC	\$11,725,125.93	\$687,581.00	Y	6	Proposed the inclusion of Metro-approved SBEs; Bauer Askew, Barge Cauthen & Associates, PWP Structural Engineers and Wilmot, Inc.
Barton Malow Company	\$11,887,453.97	\$125,000.00	Y	1.05	Proposed the inclusion of Metro-approved SBEs; Hawkins Partners, and Barge Cauthen & Associates
DOWDLE CONSTRUCTION GROUP LLC	\$11,883,958.57	\$557,523.00	Y	46.91	Proposer is a Metro-approved SBE and proposes to self-perform \$374,223 of work. Also proposed the inclusion of Metro-approved SBEs; Bauer Askew, Barge Cauthen & Associates, PWP Structural Engineers and Wilmot, Inc. for a total of \$183,300.
HARDAWAY CONSTRUCTION CORP.	\$12,581,249.21	\$582,340.00	Y	4.63	Proposed the inclusion of Metro-approved SBEs; EOA Architects, Hawkins Partners, EMC Structural Engineers, Wilmot, Inc. and Bootstrap,
Messer Construction Co.	\$11,931,655.63	\$227,775.00	Y	19.09	Proposed the inclusion of Metro-approved SBEs; EDGE Planning, Landscape Architecture & Graphic Design, DF & H Services, PLLC, Barge Cauthen & Associates, EMC Structural EngineerS.